

**OPINION 2353 (Case 3563)*****Pachylemur* Lamberton, 1948 (Primates, LEMURIDAE): generic name conserved**

**Abstract.** The Commission has conserved the name *Pachylemur* Lamberton, 1948 (Primates, LEMURIDAE) for a genus of subfossil Madagascan lemurs, by suppressing the senior subjective synonym *Palaeochirogalus* Grandidier, 1899 and by designating a type species for the genus *Pachylemur* Lamberton. *Palaeochirogalus* Grandidier has never seen any substantial usage whereas *Pachylemur* Lamberton, 1948 is in universal use; however, *Pachylemur* Lamberton, 1948 is unavailable because no type species was designated in the original publication. Filhol (1874) previously used the name *Pachylemur* for a 'groupe' of Paleogene primates; the Commission has concluded that this name, under either Filhol's or Palmer's (1904) authorship and, in either case, ambiguous as regards availability, should be formally suppressed at the genus-group level to prevent confusion.

**Keywords.** Nomenclature; taxonomy; LEMURIDAE; *Palaeochirogalus*; *Pachylemur*; *Pachylemur insignis*; lemur; Madagascar.

---

**Ruling**

- (1) Under the plenary power:
  - (a) the following generic names are hereby suppressed for the purposes of both the Principle of Priority and the Principle of Homonymy:
    - (i) *Pachylemur* Filhol, 1874;
    - (ii) *Pachylemur* Palmer, 1904;
  - (b) the generic name *Pachylemur* Lamberton, 1948 is given precedence over *Palaeochirogalus* Grandidier, 1899, whenever these names are considered to be synonyms;
  - (c) *Pachylemur* Lamberton, 1948 is ruled to be available from its original publication;
  - (d) all previous type species fixations for *Pachylemur* Lamberton, 1948 are hereby set aside and *Lemur insignis* Filhol, 1895 is hereby designated as its type species.
- (2) The following names are hereby placed on the Official List of Generic Names in Zoology:
  - (a) *Pachylemur* Lamberton, 1948 (gender: masculine); with authorship as ruled in (1)(c) above and with the type species *Lemur insignis* Filhol, 1895, as ruled in (1)(d) above, with the endorsement that it is to be given precedence over *Palaeochirogalus* Grandidier, 1899, whenever these names are considered to be synonyms;
  - (b) *Palaeochirogalus* Grandidier, 1899 (gender: masculine); type species *Palaeochirogalus jullyi* Grandidier, with the endorsement that it is not to be given priority over *Pachylemur* Lamberton, 1948, whenever these names are considered to be synonyms.



- (3) The following names are hereby placed on the Official List of Specific Names in Zoology:
- (a) *insignis* Filhol, 1895, as published in the binomen *Lemur insignis*, specific name of the type species of *Pachylemur* Lamberton, 1948, as ruled in (1)(d) above;
  - (b) *jullyi* Grandidier, 1899, as published in the binomen *Palaeochirogalus jullyi*, specific name of the type species of *Palaeochirogalus* Grandidier, 1899.
- (4) The following names are hereby placed on the Official Index of Rejected and Invalid Generic Names in Zoology:
- (a) *Pachylemur* Filhol, 1874, as suppressed in (1)(a)(i) above;
  - (b) *Pachylemur* Palmer, 1904, as suppressed in (1)(a)(ii) above;

### History of Case 3563

An application to conserve the name *Pachylemur* Lamberton, 1948 (Primates, LEMURIDAE) for a genus of subfossil Madagascan lemurs by suppressing the senior subjective synonym *Palaeochirogalus* Grandidier, 1899 and by designating a type species for the genus *Pachylemur* Lamberton was received from Jelle Zijlstra (*Rijnzichtweg 153, 2342 AZ Oegstgeest, The Netherlands*), Colin Groves (*School of Archaeology & Anthropology, Australian National University, Canberra, Australia*) and Alex Dunkel (*7305 Calibre Park Dr. #102, Durham, NC, U.S.A.*) on 19 May 2011. After correspondence the Case was published in BZN 68: 275–280 (December 2011). The title, abstract and keywords of the Case were published on the Commission's website. No comments were received on this Case. The Case was originally sent for vote on 1 September 2013. The voting results were as follows: 12 Commissioners voted FOR, 5 Commissioners voted AGAINST, 3 Commissioners ABSTAINED, 4 Commissioners SPLIT their vote. A majority of Commissioners voted FOR the Case, but it failed to meet the two-thirds majority required for approval.

Voting FOR, Kojima said that the authors should have clearly mentioned whether *Pachylemur* Filhol, 1874 and *Pachylemur* Palmer, 1904 were available or unavailable. SPLITTING his vote Alonso-Zarazaga said that the Case had been presented without a properly worked out taxonomic basis. It should have been presented again only when the proposed morphological and genetic studies of the cryptic species recognised to exist in the genus *Pachylemur* are carried out and if this study could not solve the existing nomenclatural conflicts. The reference given by the authors for Filhol's paper was incomplete; every article in this journal having its own pagination, the number of the article (4) should have been mentioned. Filhol's concept of 'type zoologique' corresponded to what we today call a taxon. After having read the original paper, he considered that the name *Pachylemur* had been proposed for a group of genera, more or less corresponding to a 'supergenous', not for a family-group taxon, since it was given in the singular, latinized and italicized, while all the family-groups he used were written in the plural, in French and in Roman type. He explained that there was nothing in Articles 11, 12 and 30 precluding the creation of 'supergenera', since the definition of genus-group in Article 11.8 does not mention any mandatory rank or a limited number of these. Included ranks are mentioned only in Article 42.1, but it does not peremptorily exclude any further rank. Moreover, Filhol did not use this name in any other part of his work, while still using as valid



such names included in this ‘supergenous’ as *Paleolemur betillei* or *Adapis magnus*. If considered to be available as a genus, one of these two species would become its type species. In the first case it would become a junior objective synonym of *Paleolemur* Delfortrie, 1873; in the second, it would be a senior objective synonym of *Leptadapis* Gervais, 1876, adding thus to the general conundrum. That is why he considered *Pachylemur* should be suppressed. However, he opposed the suppression of *Palaeochirogalus*, which is based on another type species, and which could be considered in the future a valid genus. He said he supported reversal of precedence instead, this name remaining available if needed, and he proposed that the Commission take action on this on its own initiative under Articles 78.2.3 and 83 to avoid losing a good name for no valid reason; he urged the Secretariat to start the appropriate procedure. Also SPLITTING his vote Harvey commented that he agreed with the suggestion to suppress the names *Pachylemur* Filhol, 1874 and *Pachylemur* Palmer, 1904, which would protect the name in current use. ABSTAINING, Lamas said that he felt that he could not vote either for or against the proposals of the authors, as not enough information had been given. Also ABSTAINING, Ng said that he was not completely comfortable with this proposal as it might be better for the authors to ask that the first and oldest use of the name *Pachylemur* be credited.

In accordance with the bylaws, the case was sent for a revote on 3 June 2014 and included two sets of proposals. Original proposals (Set A) and alternative proposals (Set B) are both repeated below.

#### SET A (2nd round)

The International Commission on Zoological Nomenclature is accordingly asked:

- (1) to use its plenary power:
  - (a) to suppress the following generic names for the purposes of both the Principle of Priority and Principle of Homonymy;
    - (i) *Pachylemur* Filhol, 1874;
    - (ii) *Pachylemur* Palmer, 1904;
  - (b) to suppress the generic name *Palaeochirogalus* Grandidier, 1899 for the purposes of the Principle of Priority but not for those of the Principle of Homonymy;
  - (c) to rule that the name *Pachylemur* Lamberton, 1948 is available from its original publication;
  - (d) to set aside all previous type species fixations for *Pachylemur* Lamberton, 1948 and designate *Lemur insignis* Filhol, 1895 as the type species;
- (2) to place on the Official List of Generic Names in Zoology the name *Pachylemur* Lamberton, 1948, type species *Lemur insignis* Filhol, 1895, as ruled in (1)(c) and (1)(d) above;
- (3) to place on the Official List of Specific Names in Zoology the name *insignis* Filhol, 1895, as published in the binomen *Lemur insignis*, specific name of the type species of *Pachylemur* Lamberton, 1948, as ruled in (1)(d) above.
- (4) to place on the Official Index of Rejected and Invalid Generic Names in Zoology the following names:
  - (a) *Pachylemur* Filhol, 1874, as suppressed in (1)(a)(i) above;
  - (b) *Pachylemur* Palmer, 1904, as suppressed in (1)(a)(ii) above;
  - (c) *Palaeochirogalus* Grandidier, 1899, as suppressed in (1)(b) above.



**SET B (1st round) (as proposed by Miguel Alonso-Zarazaga in his comment above):**

The International Commission on Zoological Nomenclature is accordingly asked:

- (1) to use its plenary power:
  - (a) to suppress the following generic names for the purposes of both the Principle of Priority and Principle of Homonymy;
    - (i) *Pachylemur* Filhol, 1874;
    - (ii) *Pachylemur* Palmer, 1904;
  - (b) to give the generic name *Pachylemur* Lamberton, 1948 precedence over *Palaeochirogalus* Grandidier, 1899, whenever these names are considered to be synonyms;
  - (c) to rule that the name *Pachylemur* Lamberton, 1948 is available from its original publication;
  - (d) to set aside all previous type species fixations for *Pachylemur* Lamberton, 1948 and designate *Lemur insignis* Filhol, 1895 as the type species;
- (2) to place on the Official List of Generic Names in Zoology the following names:
  - (a) *Pachylemur* Lamberton, 1948, type species *Lemur insignis* Filhol, 1895, as ruled in (1)(c) and (1)(d) above, with the endorsement that it is to be given precedence over *Palaeochirogalus* Grandidier, 1899, whenever these names are considered to be synonyms;
  - (b) *Palaeochirogalus* Grandidier, 1899, with the endorsement that it is not to be given priority over *Pachylemur* Lamberton, 1948, whenever these names are considered to be synonyms;
- (3) to place on the Official List of Specific Names in Zoology the following names:
  - (a) *insignis* Filhol, 1895, as published in the binomen *Lemur insignis*, specific name of the type species of *Pachylemur* Lamberton, 1948, as ruled in (1)(d) above;
  - (b) *jullyi* Grandidier, 1899, as published in the binomen *Palaeochirogalus jullyi*, specific name of the type species of *Palaeochirogalus* Grandidier, 1899;
- (4) to place on the Official Index of Rejected and Invalid Generic Names in Zoology the following names:
  - (a) *Pachylemur* Filhol, 1874, as suppressed in (1)(a)(i) above;
  - (b) *Pachylemur* Palmer, 1904, as suppressed in (1)(a)(ii) above;

**Decision of the Commission**

At the close of the voting period on 3 December 2014 the votes were as follows:

**Set A:**

Affirmative votes – 1: Fautin.

Negative votes – 19: Alonso-Zarazaga, Ballerio, Bogutskaya, Brothers, Bouchet, Grygier, Halliday, Harvey, Krell, Kullander, Lamas, Pape, Rosenberg, Štys, van Tol, Winston, Yanega, Zhang and Zhou.

Kojima split his vote: abstain (1)(a) and (1)(c), against (1)(b) and for (1)(d).

Kottelat, Ng, Patterson and Pyle and were on leave of absence.



**Set B:**

Affirmative votes – 17: Alonso-Zarazaga, Ballerio, Bogutskaya, Brothers, Grygier, Halliday, Harvey, Krell, Kullander, Lamas, Pape, Rosenberg, Štys, Winston, Yanega, Zhang and Zhou.

Negative votes – 3: Bouchet, Fautin and van Tol.

Kojima split his vote: abstain (1)(a) and (1)(c) and for (1)(b) (1)(d).

Kottelat, Ng, Patterson and Pyle and were on leave of absence.

SPLITTING his vote, Kojima said that the authors should have clearly stated whether *Pachylemur* Filhol, 1874 and *Pachylemur* Palmer, 1904 were available or unavailable before they had asked the Commission to use its plenary power to suppress the two generic names; or the authors first could have asked the Commission to use its specific power to list *Pachylemur* Filhol, 1874 and *Pachylemur* Palmer, 1904 as available names and then they could have asked the Commission to use its plenary power to suppress the two generic names. He added that the synonymy of *Palaeochirogalus* Grandidier, 1899 and *Pachylemur* Lamberton, 1948 was a taxonomic decision, and that there were not sufficient nomenclatural grounds to suppress the generic name *Palaeochirogalus* Grandidier, 1899. Voting AGAINST Set A and FOR Set B, Kullander said that *Pachylemur* Filhol was evidently a genus-level name under modern code standards, despite any other terminology used in the original paper. The rest of the application was mostly confusing, e.g. the reference to common names as an argument. He explained that he preferred Alonso-Zarazaga's alternative proposal to end the uncertainties that mammalogists might have had with these animals.

**Original references**

The following are the original references to the names placed on the Official Lists and Indexes by the ruling given in the present Opinion:

*Pachylemur* Filhol, 1874, *Annales des Sciences Géologiques*, **5**: 18.

*Pachylemur* Palmer, 1904, *North American Fauna*, **23**: 494.

*Pachylemur* Lamberton, 1948, *Bulletin de l'Académie Malgache*, (n.s.) **27**: 7.

*Palaeochirogalus* Grandidier, 1899, *Bulletin du Muséum National d'Histoire Naturelle*, **5**: 345.

*insignis*, Lemur, Filhol, 1895, *Bulletin du Muséum National d'Histoire Naturelle*, **1**: 12.

*jullyi*, *Palaeochirogalus*, Grandidier, 1899, *Bulletin du Muséum National d'Histoire Naturelle*, **5**: 345.